



## Moral Values in School Textbooks during the Second Constitution and Early Republican Periods: The Case of the Lectures on Morality<sup>1</sup>

Ramazan ALABAŞ<sup>2</sup>

<sup>2</sup>Kastamonu University, Faculty of Education, Kastamonu, Turkey, ORCID: 0000-0002-9278-2534

**To cite this article:** Alabaş, R. (2019). Moral Values in School Textbooks during the Second Constitution and Early Republican Periods: The Case of the Lectures on Morality, *International Online Journal of Educational Sciences*, 11 (3), 73-86.

### ARTICLE INFO

*Article History:*

Received: 15.03.2019

Available online:  
28.06.2019

### ABSTRACT

The civics class; Lectures on Morality (Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye) can be considered as one of the fundamental ingredient for classes taught in Turkey such as Human Rights, Citizenship and Democracy, Life Skills and Social Sciences. The main aim of the article is to analyze the moral values that are depicted in two textbooks entitled 'Lectures on Morality' belonging to two consecutive periods; first printed in 1333 (1917) during the Constitutional Period (1908-1918) and the latter printed in 1339 (1923) in the early days of the Turkish Republic. This research uses qualitative methodology, focusing on content analysis of these textbooks: "The New Lectures on Morality, Religion, Civilization and History" and "The New Lectures on Morality and Civilization with Illustrations." The article asserts that the textbooks adopted a moral approach based on "sense of duty", and explains that a moral person needs first and foremost 'religious morality' which is instrumental in the foundation and strengthening of moral values. That said, a person also needs to embody individual moral values that include health, cleanliness, simplicity, prudence, righteousness, self-respect, modesty, courage, cool-headedness, patience, self-confidence, entrepreneurship, tidiness and protection of life. The morals of social duties have been understood as part of duties towards humanity and are discussed under social morality. In the textbooks, social life has been seen through a functionalist approach that values social cohesion and advocates the idea of living together in a society that requires respect to human rights and knowledge on the value of helping each other, and sustaining interpersonal relations according to civilized behavior.

© 2019 IOJES. All rights reserved

### Keywords:

Elementary school, moral value, values education, second constitutional period, early republican period

### Introduction

Values and morality are interrelated concepts that play a crucial role in shaping moral judgments of individuals and societies. According to Güngör (1997:16) morality is "a system of rules that regulates the interactions between people." It can also be understood as a transcendent entity and as a 'realm of value' that deals with interpersonal relations (Ülken, 1958). Values as such have shown the ideal ways of thinking and behaving in societies (Fichter, 2001). Within this context, the discussion on morality has become closely linked with values, which are a critical factor that influences an individual's thoughts, attitudes and behaviors. As

<sup>1</sup>Part of this study was presented at the International Symposium on Social Studies VII, Kırşehir, Turkey, October 2018.

<sup>2</sup> Corresponding author's address: Kastamonu University, Faculty of Education, Department of Educational Sciences, Kastamonu, Turkey

Telephone: +90 366 280 3353

e-mail: ramazanalabas@gmail.com – ralabas@kastamonu.edu.tr

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.15345/iojes.2019.03.006>

such, values are the belief, thought and norm systems that embody cultures to which societies are bounded and connected (Ülken, 1969).

As value system is one of the pillars that morals embrace, value judgments which are considered 'right' become an important aspect of deciding whether actions are moral or not. In that sense, moral acts are "conscious behaviors that are based on free and good will of a reasonable, wise and will-powered individual" and their value depends on the standards accepted by the discipline of morals. So, if the thought or the act is appropriate to the main principles of that particular moral, it can be considered as 'good morals', if it is not appropriate, it can be regarded as 'bad morals' (Erdem, 2006:67). What has been accomplished then is the introduction of the moral values to the individual; of do's and do not's, and what is considered good or bad. The idea that morality should be given within a program through education has been an important and indispensable interest of education's mission of 'raising the ideal individual'. Moral education and citizenship education have always dealt with the question of what kind of characteristics a moral person should embody. The answer leads to acting according to the kind of individual one aspires to be. Within the confines of formal education, moral education can be traced in all the classes taught at various levels; in some instances, as a separate "morals" class that discusses the relationship between morality and values, in others, these concepts being discussed within the related content of a specific class. In these courses, morals education is taught according to the basics of morality (religious, anthropological, social, etc.) (Kamer & Alabaş, 2017). In the history of education in Turkey, during the Second Constitutional Period and the early years of the Turkish Republic, one of the civics classes for the primary school level that aimed to give morals education and teach the moral values an individual should possess is "*Lectures on Morality (Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye)*".

In the Second Constitutional Period, from 1908 to 1918, the previous educational mentality of the Tanzimat period had been revoked and a new configuration for national education had been researched (Ergün, 1996). In this period, the notion of 'educating the new generation' in which children were perceived not only within the confines of traditional values, but more importantly as individuals and citizens was endorsed (Akyüz, 2018). Special attention was given to the prominence of citizenship education within the framework of this new project; the construction of the new individual (Üstel, 2014). In the new Primary School Curriculum (*Mekâtib-i İbtidaiye Ders Müfredatı*) of 1913 and 1914 prepared by the Ministry of Education, a new educational goal; raising 'good citizens' was added to the previous goal of raising religious individuals (Batır, 2007:160). In this period, the issue of morality indeed played a prominent role in raising 'good citizens'. Furthermore, the issue of morals identified and discussed as one of the reasons leading to the collapse of the Ottoman State during the Second Constitutional Period (Yazıbaşı, 2014).

The process that had started with the First Constitutional Period and continued with the restoration of the Kanun-i Esâsi (First Ottoman Constitution) on 24 July 1908 was a period in which, while the loyalty of the Ottoman citizens (*tebâ*) to the state was questioned quite intensively, a special attention and effort was paid to holding all the Ottoman citizens together. Education in this respect became a focal point of these efforts. Throughout history, the rulers or governing bodies of societies envisioned education and teaching as opportunities to direct policies towards the desired way of life according to their visions and beliefs (Ayhan, 2000). Therefore, during the Second Constitutional Period, individuals were educated and expected to embrace "Ottomanism" as an identity. Consequently, due to the wars in which the Ottoman State was engaged and territory losses of the Empire, the textbooks also started to include Turkish nationalism along Ottomanism. Morals education played a prominent role in these endeavors and was included in the primary school curriculum. With the Temporal Decree of Primary Education (*Tedrisat-ı İbtidaiyye Kanunun-ı Muvakkati*) of 1913 a new 'civics' class entitled *Knowledge on Civilization, Morality and Economics (Malûmat-ı Medeniye ve Ahlâkiye ve İktisadiye)* was added to the curriculum (Özalp, 1982) and continued to be taught in the early Republican period (Cicioğlu, 1985). In 1913, a new curriculum, Curriculum for Primary Schools with One and Two Grades and Teachers (*Mekâtib-i İbtidaiye Ders Müfredatı Bir ve İki Dershane ve Muallimli Mekteplere Mahsus*) was prepared by the Ministry of Education and it included a new class *Lectures on Morality (History, Health, and Civilization) [Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye (Tarihiye, Sıhhiye ve Medeniye)]* as a subsection of Reading classes (Maarif-i Umûmiye Nezareti, 1913:5). The same class was included in the *Curriculum for Primary Schools with Six, Five, Four and Three Grades and Teachers* of 1914 (Maarif-i Umûmiye Nezareti, 1914). According to the curriculum, primary schools were divided into three terms; *devre-i evveli* (the beginners' level), *devre-i mutavassıta* (the intermediate level), *devre-i âliye* (the upper level). In its structure, each term include two grades. Lectures on Morality's

contact hours were 3 in the beginner's level and 2 in the second grade. At the intermediate level, the instruction was 2 hours for the first, and 1 hour for the second grade, and lastly, at the upper level, both grades receive an hour of instruction. In the School for Girls (*İnâs İbtidâî Mektebi*), the curriculum stated that there are different concentrations for girls such as conversations on family, family harmony and affection, home economics and management (Maarif-i Umûmiye Nezareti, 1914:113). According to the Curriculum of 1914, *Lectures on Morality* demanded attention and thoughtfulness from the students and was envisioned as a "thought and mind provoking class" (Maarif-i Umûmiye Nezareti, 1914:132). The class continued to be in the curriculum of the newly founded Turkish Republic's Primary Schools Curriculum in 1924, with a slight name change: *Lectures on Morality and Knowledge of the Homeland*. The content of the *Lectures on Morality (History, Health, and Civilization)* constituted the foundations for some of the classes of the Republican Era: Civics, Morals, Examination of Societies and Countries, Social Sciences, Knowledge on Citizenship, Citizenship and Human Rights, Human Rights, Citizenship and Democracy, and Democracy and Human Rights.

The developments of the Second Constitutional Period, and the processes that led to the foundation of the Republic affected the preparation of the education programs of the early days of the Turkish Republic. The new textbooks were the revised versions of the older textbooks. In accordance with the Republican ideals, changes were made; some of the content was removed and new content was added. In the recent literature, while one can find research on the morals education of the Second Constitutional Period with connections to the *Lectures on Morality* class (Doğan, 1994; Erdem, 2006; Pehlivan Ağırakça, 2013; Alkan, 2014; Üstel, 2014; Yazıbaşı, 2014; Meydan, 2015; Yinilmez Akagündüz, 2017), there is limited research (Alabaş, 2018) on the issues mentioned above in the transition to the Republican Era. What has not been looked upon is moral values in the *Lectures on Morality* of the transition era (which ends with publication of the new curriculum of the Republic), and comparison to the textbooks of the Second Constitutional Period. The article's intention is to contribute to the limited literature by not only giving information on the content of the textbooks, but also tracing the change of perceptions of the representation of values in these textbooks. That said, these textbooks are invaluable sources for the history of education in Turkey. The article will analyze the moral values in the textbooks of *Lectures on Morality* printed in 1333 (1917) and 1339 (1923) for primary school first grade intermediate level, the first belonging to the Second Constitutional Period and the latter to the Turkish Republican era. The article will first decipher the general characteristics of these textbooks and later compare how moral values are identified in both textbooks.

### Methodology

As the research is based on moral values and the changes in the representation of these moral values over time, it uses qualitative research methods with special attention to "document analysis" (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013). Within the confines of the method, the necessary steps that needed to be taken are "skimming (superficial examination), reading (thorough examination), and interpretation" of the sources (Bowen, 2009). The research follows the steps proposed by Forster (1995); locating and authenticating the documents, making sense of the document, before analyzing and using the document (as cited in Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013:223). The two textbooks used in the research are *The New Lectures on Morality, Religion, Civilization and History (Yeni Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye, Diniye, Medeniye, Tarihiye)* co-written by H. Natan and Midhat Sadullah and printed in 1333 (1917) and the second entitled *The New Lectures on Morality and Civilization with Illustrations (Resimli, Yeni Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye ve Medeniye)* written by Midhat Sadullah and printed in 1339 (1923). Criteria sampling, a type of purposive sampling, has been used.

As part of the criteria sampling method (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013) the criteria used to choose the textbooks are having the same writer and focusing on/being used by the same grade levels. During the document analysis, the article follows Bailey's approach of choosing sample, developing categories, determining unit of analysis and quantification (as cited by Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013:227). At the first stage, whole textbooks were read and analyzed from cover to cover without sampling. At the second stage, the textbooks use the type of "moral duties" categorized in the Curriculum for Primary Schools that are "religious duties, personal duties, duties towards family, duties towards homeland, duties towards humanity and duties towards animals". Hence, the article uses these six types of duties as categories and analyzes and identifies the moral values in the textbooks accordingly. In some texts, where more than one moral value is discussed, the "primary moral value" was designated by looking into the title and the gist of the text. At the third stage, "content, sentence and paragraph" has been determined as the unit of analysis. As Yıldırım & Şimşek (2013)

stated, in some cases, the results of the analysis can be reported in a narrative form rather than quantification of the analysis as this article has done. The research called for expert opinions in order to solidify the credibility of the research. The experts agreed on the categories that has come up during the content analysis. Furthermore, to accomplish transferability in the research, the detailed description approach has been used.

## Findings

The findings from the textbooks have been examined in two sections: The general background of the textbooks and the moral values in the textbooks.

### The General Background on *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye* Textbooks

Both textbooks were used in *devre-i mutavassıta* (the intermediate level) for first graders. According to the Curriculum for Primary Schools of 1913 and 1914, the intermediate level is the second stage of primary school education and it is for children aged between 9 and 10. The first textbook, 'The New Lectures on Morality, Religion, Civilization and History' printed in 1333(1917) was co-written by H. Natan and Midhat Sadullah, a prominent educator of his age. The textbook opens up with a note informing the reader that the textbook is suitable for all primary schools and had been accepted as a result of a competition by the Ministry of Education. Printed in İstanbul by the Şirket-i Mürettebiye Printing House, the textbook is composed of 175 pages. The content of the intermediate level first grade classes is found on the second and third pages, the remaining 169 pages are the content pages and the last 6 pages are devoted to a "dictionary" section. The textbook also includes a total of 86 texts and 6 poems. 53 of the texts are informative; and 33 of them are labeled as "Lectures (*musahabe*)" and most of them is composed of stories. One can assert that "lectures" as a concept is here used to solidify the main points of the informative sections. Stories are in short story or fable format; giving examples from daily life while underlining the causes and effects of actions, these examples help to reify abstract concepts. In some cases, although the texts are supported by illustrations, some are followed by a 'Questions' section. While the main objective stays on comprehension of the texts (briefly the events, actors and the main points), there are a few questions that intend to probe interpretation and inquiry.

'The New lectures on Morality and Civilization with Illustrations' was published 6 years after the first version, in 1339 (1923). This time, Midhat Sadullah was the sole author and the textbook opened with the notice "approved by the Ministry of Education for all schools and revised according to our national revolution." The textbook was printed in İstanbul, by Orhaniye Printing House, and is composed of 96 pages. Whereas 93 pages are dedicated to main content, the last three pages are devoted to the table of contents section. The textbook includes 47 texts; only 14 of them made up of short stories, and the rest are informative texts. Compared to the 1333 version, the textbook has fewer short stories. Even though there is only one, one can find an excerpt from a newspaper. The texts are supported by illustrations, stories, and like the earlier version, in some cases the texts end with "Questions for Conversation (*Musahabe İçin Sualler*)", in others with a "Summary (*Hulâsa*)" section. The textbook warned teachers on the uses of the summary section: "The intention of these summaries is not to make students memorize, but to help students to understand the main points of the texts as correctly as possible." In the 1333 version, *Hulâsa* as an expression/word is used only once in the text entitled "Proper Living", in some other parts, the summary of the texts was shown with the use of different fonts, and font sizes. Additionally, whilst the 1333 version only accepted the short stories as "lectures", in the 1339 version all texts were regarded as "lectures".

### The Moral Values in the *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye* Textbooks

**Religious Morality.** In both textbooks, the value of religious belief has been positioned as the most encompassing moral value. This value appeared under the "Duties towards God and Servitude" and issues of faith, fraternity of Muslims, orders of the religion, Quran, cleanliness and kindness have been discussed. Both textbooks underlined the importance of faith as the pillar of the moral values; "There is no doubt that our most important and divine duty is our religious duties." According to the textbooks, faith and worship need to be adhered to "as our religion dictates acts that resonate goodness: righteousness, kindness, cleanliness, not drinking alcohol, not stealing from others, harming no one, and remaining our distance from bad things." Thereby, the text expounds on what is good or bad about human actions with the use of examples. That said, the Republican Era version revised, sorted out, and left out some of the 'expressions' or information of the 1333 version. In

some cases, changes in the way some of the concepts are explained or, while the content were not touched, changes in the verbalization of the texts can be detected. A section under the title, “non-believers, superstitious beliefs and caliphate”; which explains that non-believers can never have a clear conscience, that the Sultan is the caliphate of the Muslims, and that there are some superstitious beliefs or religions in Europe and the U.S.A., has been removed from the 1339 version. In both textbooks, the relationship between religious belief, cleanliness and kindness has been presented and exemplified with connection to places of worship and cleanliness of the body and clothes, cleanliness of homes and wearing white shirts.

**Individual Morality.** Both textbooks perceive personal duties within individual morals, categorized as the second most important moral duty after religious morality. More space has been devoted to the values in this group compared to the rest, which underlines its significance. Below in the table are text headings and the primary moral value it attested to under the subheading “Personal Duties.”

**Table 1.** Moral values under the individual morality category in *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye*

The New Lectures on Morality, Religion, Civilization and History dated 1333		The New Lectures on Morality and Civilization with Illustrations dated 1339	
Text item number/Text Name	Primary Moral Value	Text item number/Text Name	Primary Moral Value
2/Maintaining health-a hardworking student	Being Healthy	2/ Maintaining health	Being Healthy
3/Cleanliness- What are the benefits of cleanliness? Windows of the tiny house	Cleanliness	3/ Cleanliness	Cleanliness
4/Moderation in appearance and food-drink	Being Moderate	4/ Moderation in appearance and food-drink	Being Moderate
5/Avoidance of pleasure-seeking	Being Moderate	5/ Avoidance of pleasure-seeking	Being Moderate
6/ Simplicity	Being Moderate	6/ Simplicity	Being Moderate
7/Exercise and activity	Being Healthy	7/ Exercise and activity	Being Healthy
8/Saving	Being Prudent	8/ Saving, avoiding debt	Being Prudent
9/Avoiding wastefulness	Being Prudent	9/Envy (Stinginess)	Being Prudent
10/Avoiding debt	Being Prudent	10/Wastefulness	Being Prudent
11/Wastefulness	Being Prudent	11/Work and strenuousness	Hardworking
12/ Envy (Stinginess)	Being Prudent	12/Sincerity-righteousness	Righteousness /Honesty
13/ Work and strenuousness	Hardworking	13/ Self respectability	Self-Respect
14/Sincerity	Righteousness / Honesty	14/ Working on correcting our flaws	Righteousness / Honesty
15/Two genuine siblings	Righteousness / Honesty	15/Not being arrogant	Modesty
16/ Righteousness –upright kid	Righteousness / Honesty	16/Courage, patience and fortitude	Courageous, Patience and Endurance
17/The stork and the fox	Honesty	17/Story: A patient kid	Courageous, Patience and Endurance
18/Laziness	Strenuous	18/Evils of rage/anger, cool-headed behavior	Cool-headedness
19/ Hard-working	Strenuous	19/A Story	Cool-headedness
20/Self respectability	Self-Respect	20/ Self respectability	Self-Respect
21/ Curiosity to explore	Protecting Self Respect	21/Blessings of supreme being of God	Entrepreneurship
22/Detecting and correcting our flaws	Righteousness / Honesty	22/Idea of entrepreneurship	Entrepreneurship
23/Pride	Modesty	23/ Living properly	Tidiness
24/Valor and courage in times of danger and catastrophe	Courageous		

25/Cool-headed behavior	Cool-headedness	24/ Order while working	Tidiness
26/Patience-Patient kid	Patience	25/A Story: Protecting one's life	Protection of One's Life
27/Good things come to those who wait	Patience	26/Individual freedom	Strenuousness
28/Idea of entrepreneurship	Entrepreneurship	27/Trade	Entrepreneurship
29/Trade	Entrepreneurship		
30/ Blessings of the supreme being of God	Entrepreneurship		
31/ Self confidence	Self Confidence		
32/ Living properly	Tidiness		
33/ Order on duty/while working	Tidiness		
34/Protection of one's life	Protection of One's Life		

As seen in Table 1, as a value connected to individual morality, mental strength was perceived as being as crucial as physical health and protecting one's life. In the *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye* classes, this persistence on health is a result of the concerns about teaching children the importance of health and a desire to put an end to child deaths, during the Second Constitution and Early Republican periods. Under the "Preserving Health" section, both textbooks underlined the importance of reading and developing knowledge to preserving one's health and recommended paying special attention to the scientific approaches to physical health. An individual's second most important primary moral value is "moderation". This value carries not only material assets, but also encompasses the attitudes and actions of individuals. Being moderate in what you wear, what you eat, and drink were associated with the idea of consumption and health. Buying lots of clothing, and youth wearing different clothes every day were aligned with the opposite of moderation. In the 1333 version, it is stated that "*Wearing tight dresses to be stylish is not only bad for health but also foolish.*" That said, in the 1339 version wearing tight and high heel shoes, corset, very tight clothes, and tight and high collars were considered harmful for health.

Moderation was also linked with simplicity and was exemplified in the choice of a moderate student: using regular, cheap pencils instead of expensive European imported pencils. Both textbooks asserted that the simplicity of a man's clothing and accessories could be understood from his color choices. Following this assertion, women who didn't value simplicity, value flamboyance and jewelry. They made themselves fools by wearing big earrings, necklaces, or thick bracelets. Seeking pleasure and enjoyment in life were seen as harmful for morality and health. Especially during childhood, while playing and having fun seems like a necessity, moderation was recommended in the textbooks. In the 1339 version, individuals who fall into pleasures of life were recognized as dangerous to society because of their inability to fulfill personal duties, duties towards their families and their community.

Prudence as a moral value follows moderation and simplicity. In this respect, the importance of saving for the future has been underlined with a hard-working father figure. The children were reminded of working and earning to have better lives. In the 1339 version, money management and saving has been supported by learning about 'family budgeting'. What has been recommended in the textbook is preparation of a yearly budget and saving some money for the 'emergency fund' which was assigned to the head of the family. Stinginess has been equated with lying and drunkenness, and as the textbook explains, linked with cheating and/or fraud as a stingy person might be blinded by the idea of collecting as much as possible.

Hardwork, righteousness and honesty made the next category under individual morality. Although hardwork has been epitomized by various stories, the importance of righteousness was underlined by the accord between discourse and action. Self-respect was identified by one's constant effort of distancing from bad habits and degrading acts around people. These actions were summarized by a walking drunk and a student who didn't do his/her assignment which meant not completing his/her duties. Self-respect can be maintained by keeping a distance from others, and not barging into other people's lives.

The following moral values are heroism and courage, which were explained in relation to patience and strength and the importance of never giving up; being determined in order to accomplish the desired outcome.

Both textbooks explained the types of courage during war, or by making a living and never stopping work in times of crises or catastrophes. The statements; *“courageous at war, going into war fearlessly without hesitation”, “to defend our country, we have to be courageous”* in the 1333 version have been replaced with *“our elders were courageous and brave. We have to be like them”* in the 1339 version. This added value was meant to emphasize the sense of pride one must carry from the past.

Both textbooks also identified self-confidence with a “refined character” and found it a necessity for individual morality. In the 1333 version, a comparison to Europe has been made to illustrate how one can achieve self-confidence. The progress that Europe had accomplished was attributed to self-confidence whereas Ottomans’ identified with falling into the same hesitation; *“Am I going to be able to do this or not?”* which leads to desperation. This lack of self-confidence causes Ottomans’ backwardness compared with Europe, and the remedy for progress is gaining confidence. In the 1339 version, the only difference is the replacement of ‘Europe’ with ‘civilized nations.’

The following value, entrepreneurship, is explained in relation to recognizing and bringing out the richness of the country; the natural resources such as water, forestry and mining, and increasing production. This dilemma of lacking production but having such rich natural resources has been communicated to students in various statements: *“Please think about why we had to import our shoes, fez, while the supreme being of God endowed our country with such blessings.”* Both textbooks asked the same question on importing goods: *“Do you know why?”* and came up with different answers. The 1333 version reasoned with *“Turks’ inability to get accustomed to trade and the educated populace’s choice to work in the government”*. In a nutshell, it is reasoned with a lack of interest in trade and enthusiasm for government work. On the other hand, the 1339 version concentrated on creating an enthusiasm not only for trade but for arts and agriculture as well: *“We are behind the other countries in arts and trades. Dear kids, we all should be eager to work in arts, trade and agriculture.”* Additionally, the section on working at government jobs has been removed in the latter version. That said, entrepreneurship was defined as *“Everyone working on their profession, making money with their own initiative and not being a burden to the state.”* This desired reluctance of working at a government job and being a burden to the state was removed in the 1339 version.

The section on ‘Trade’ starts with an informative text, firstly defining crafts as *“molding nature into something else”* and underlining the importance of crafts for the progress of the country *“A country can only progress with developments in crafts, and trade. The countries that fall behind in crafts and commerce cannot become rich and develop.”* Both texts highlighted that even though most people choose to work at a government job for a steady income, there is also a change; that Muslim businesses are spreading in İstanbul and provinces. This emphasis on religious affiliation continued in the early Republican version with an addition to the sentence that emphasize being a Turk; *“in the old days, crafts, and trades were mostly run by foreign nationals rather than Turks.”* The success of the War of Independence was perceived as a sign for success at other fields like economics; *“Turks came through the War of Independence with great success and surprised the whole world, and God willing, will make progress in the crafts, agriculture and trade and will not give money away to foreigners.”* The 1333 version insisted on the jobs children aspire to, *“Gentleman, don’t be enthusiastic about government jobs. Be sure that farmers, traders, and artists are much happier than those working for government.”* In the 1339 version the “don’t be enthusiastic about government jobs” part has been removed and the rest kept as it is.

**Family Morality.** Both textbooks understood family as a moral value that *“heightens the feelings of honor and dignity”*. Family happiness, family’s sacrifices and the benefits of having a family for children were depicted, and the text also reminds children to be grateful for their families. While, the cosmos of family in both textbooks was depicted as a nuclear family composed of mother, father, daughter, and son, there are some cases that mention the importance of grandparents. The servants are mentioned within this section, and their responsibilities are listed as follows *“doing the duties requested, protecting the family’s assets as if their own, and obeying the wishes of the household.”* The regulation of family relations based on the duties of each member of the family is also stressed. There are not major differences in the two textbooks; only a couple of sentences were removed from a subsection. The paragraph started as *“In order to be happy, one must love all humanity. Yet, first we should love our parents and elderly”* has been changed to *“We should respect our parents and elderly.”* Even though the writers left out loving the humanity part, in other sections it has been stated that living in a loving family in the early stages of life is instrumental to developing love for the other. One of the concepts that emerges with the Second Constitutional Period is equality, which finds its resonance in the family morals as

the equal distribution of heritage. The status quo on heritage was explained in the 1333 version: *"In Europe, the older brother used to get the whole inheritance of the father. Because of that, the rest of the younger siblings have become enemies. As liberty and constitutionalism were ingrained and lighted the way, equality has been restored among siblings. Now all the siblings are equals."* These sentences were removed from the 1339 version. Both versions depicted a regular family night with a scene of a peaceful and relaxed dinner table where the father tells about a funny incident, while the children talk about what they have learned at school, and their achievements; a scene of good times with family. Additionally, the 1339 version added one of the family members playing piano or the violin to the scene.

**Patriotic Morality.** Special attention has been paid to patriotic morality, which concentrates on the duties for the country and has been identified in both textbooks with love for the country, devotion to service for the country, giving extra effort for the country, paying taxes and completing the military service. In this respect, people living in the country were bound together through patriotic feelings. In the 1333 version, patriotism has been contextualized to create the bond between the citizens of the Ottoman state with elements such as fraternity, love, cooperation, the promulgation of the Second Constitution, and the restoration of the Kanun-i Esâsi (Ottoman constitution of 1876). The progress of the Ottoman State found its premise through patriotism. The textbook mentioned the effects of the Balkan Wars (1912-1913) with the effects of poverty and migration, and underlined the importance of being alert and ready to protect the country, and taking back the lost territories:

*Patriotism means helping each other, as the individuals of the big Ottoman family. When the constitution was declared 6 or 7 years ago, all the Ottomans promised to live as true brothers and sisters. True patriotism means helping each other, preventing the injustices and discord between each other, making an effort to help those Ottomans in poverty and migrants forget the sufferings they have gone through. Duties towards our country are sacred and divine, because they are born from the grand aspiration of advancement of the society. Ottomans promised to live free and will not accept captivity or any restrictions...We should never forget our brothers and sisters who struggled for or died to protect the honor for our country in Kosovo, Shkodër (İşkodra) and Bitola (Manastır). We should work on getting back all those places that are taken unjustly from us. If we want to live not in captivity but independent and free, we have to show the utmost effort for the country. The Ottomans should grab their arms if they see their country is attacked by enemies. This is an extremely important duty. We should not forget that we have duties for our country. These can be realized by; loving and helping each other as if we came from the same family. Each individual should remember that each of us not only lives for ourselves but lives for the Ottoman homeland, Ottoman people, and Ottoman state, and obeys the laws of the state (pp. 101-104).*

Besides the emphasis on the Ottoman homeland, people and state, Turkish nation has also become convenient in explaining the value of patriotism: *"When one says Turks live in constitutionalism, one should remember striving for righteousness with all the lessons and advice that have been given with our nation's bright and grand history."* This is evident also in the verses of Mehmet Emin's poem While Going to War (Cenge Giderken) *"I am a Turk, my religion, my race is almighty"*. In another text that focuses on crafts, the Turk appears: *"We, Turks need crafts masters."* The effects of the Balkan Wars can be noticed in the issue of the loss of territories; *"Greeks, Bulgarians, Serbians and Montenegrin, the lands that they seized"* and in the stories linked with heroism such as the killing of a 13-14-year-old kid, who refused to say *"Goddamned Ottomans!"* In the 1339 version, the emphasis on Turkish and Muslim hoods is evident with an excerpt article called *"All our Hopes are with the Coming Generation"* from Tevhid-i Efkâr newspaper, emphasized with *"This generation will glorify Turks and Islam."*

Duties towards the state are defined as abiding by the law and military service and taxes. Military service is linked with one's devotion to one's country, and is seen as the utmost duty to the country, and martyrdom has been glorified. In the 1333 version, fighting or dying for the country were associated with martyrdom and veterans, whereas the implementation of the compulsory military service for the non-Muslim population of the Ottoman State has been explained with the principle of equality and the honorable nature of military service for every citizen without any religious difference has been underlined. All these statements have been removed from the 1339 version.



**Social morality.** In both textbooks, individuals were held accountable not only for themselves, their families, friends, teachers and elders, but to all humanity. Below in the table are text headings and the primary moral value it attested to under the subheading “Duties towards Humanity”.

**Table 2.** Moral values under social morality category in *Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye*

The New Lectures on Morality, Religion, Civilization and History dated 1333		The New Lectures on Morality and Civilization with Illustrations dated 1339	
Text Name	Primary Moral Value	Text Name	Primary Moral Value
Helping each other	Helpfulness	Helping each other	Helpfulness
Reading	Social Dependence	Respect to everyone’s livelihood, Independence, dignity, honour, assets, faith	Respect to Rights
Reading (Benefits of help and cooperation)	Social Dependence	Evils of insult, disdain, mockery, slander and stealing	Righteousness /Honesty
Respect to everyone’s livelihood, independence, dignity, assets, faith	Respect to Rights	Compliance to commitments and terms of agreements	Righteousness
Villager’s shed (Poem)	Love for the Villagers	Compassion to those who are in need; the poor, patients, survivors	Helpfulness
Evils of insult, condemning, mockery, slander and stealing	Righteousness /Honesty	Self-Sacrifice	Self-Sacrifice
Slander to poet Lenas The will of Harun al-Rashid	Not Tell Lies Not Tell Lies	Compliance to the forms of being civil	Being Civil in Relations
Compliance to the terms of agreements	Righteousness		
Compliance to promises	Keeping Promise		
Gratefulness	Being Grateful		
Sergeant’s wetnurse	Being Grateful		
Helping and showing compassion to everyone	Helpfulness		
Give me ten Lira (Poem)	Helpfulness		
Being fair is not sufficient	Fellowship		
Helping each other	Helpfulness		
Helping	Helpfulness		
Self-Sacrifice	Self-Sacrifice		
Compliance to the forms of being civil	Being Civil in Relations		

As seen in table 2, the 1333 version has devoted more texts, a total of 19, to the category of social morality, and each informative text was followed by a short story or poem that illustrates the moral value examined. Loving humanity without discrimination is seen as a duty to humanity in both textbooks. The reasoning behind the duties towards humanity is explained with social cohesion and necessities of living together and sharing tasks as a society in two reading sections, which were removed from the 1339 version. Although the 1333 version speaks of “loving all people, despite their nationality, homeland, religion”, “loving all people” disappeared from the 1339 and “loving all people who didn’t harm us” “was added. Equality among humanity is

explained with the racist discrimination towards Blacks, and the Catholic and Protestant divide at first. Later on, discrimination to Christianity and Islam was added in the 1339 version. It can be asserted that as the spirit of the Second Constitutional Period entails, the aim was to embrace all subjects of the Ottoman State underlined with loving all the people who were connected in brother/sister 'hood'. As stated above, the idea that all humanity is connected in brother/sister 'hood' was removed in the latter version.

**Duties towards Protecting Animals.** Protecting and being good to animals were considered as a behavior closely linked with morally being good; cruelty to animals on the other hand is understood as one of the evils. Whereas, both textbooks authorized killing of animals who harmed humans, they underlined the evils of killing or harming animals that humans worked with such as horses, donkeys and farm animals. In the 1333 version, justice has been emphasized with "*justice orders not to torment humans, and very clearly orders not to torment the animals.*" This sentence has been removed from the 1339 version. In the 1333 version, cruelty to animals has been described with "*Kids who throw rocks at birds' nests are traitors. Likewise, organizing cockfights is an atrocious act.*" These statements were removed from the latter version. Especially being nice to animals used for saddling has been underlined in both versions, and it is strongly recommended not to whip fallen horses.

### Discussion and Concluding Remarks

In this article, moral values and the perceptions of the representation of values have been discussed and compared in the 1333(1917) and 1339(1923) printed textbooks, "Lectures on Morality", which were prepared for the intermediate level of the first grade of primary school. Both textbooks were appropriate to the content headings of the 1913 and 1914 Curriculum for Primary Schools. Grammatically, the imperatives and necessitives dominantly determine the language of the textbooks.

Moral values have been taught, discussed and evaluated through informative texts, stories, proverbs and even though small in numbers poems. The content was solidified with various examples, comparisons and use of metaphors, enriched by illustrations and questions that aim to direct students to critical thinking of the texts and interpretation of the concepts. The 1333 version included a Writing Assignment (*kitabeta vazifesi*) which intended to lead students to interpret and inquire on certain issues. The textbooks were not solely based on the lectures of the teacher, but they used methods and techniques that ask for student engagement. This perception aligns with the pursuit of innovation in teaching methods and education in general during the Second Constitutional years, which is a shift from a teacher, textbook and memorization centered approach to a subject, material, observation and research-oriented approach (Güven, 2014:257). Satı Bey, a prominent figure in education, suggested a student-centered discovery method (*usul-i tekşif*) in morals teaching, which aims for students to reach knowledge through self-discovery (Şanal, 2001; Oruç, 2007). One can assert that this new search for teaching methods has been evident in the textbooks of morals education in the Second Constitution Period. That said, morals education plays a prominent role in today's primary school education programs, while following the current understanding of morals education, it is reflected through questions and texts such as stories and poems. Moreover, the 1339 version is shorter and has a simplified language and some of the Arabic words are removed.

Both works perceived and linked 'morality' and preached moral values grounded in "duty" and "rights" that support 'good habits'. Additionally, the principle of "moral and legal obligations" is stressed in some instances. In this respect, lack of moral behavior is connected to what society perceives as "evils" and its relation to legality is also underlined. Moral actions were approached within the discourses of right/wrong, good/bad and obligations and an individual's desire to receive validation from social spheres (family, teachers, society etc.). Both textbooks stated that people carry both good and bad habits, and what is most important and critical is self-discovery and the correction of mistakes as needed. Both textbooks see school age as the most critical age to correct mistakes, and state that in the later stages of life, correcting bad habits becomes complicated. During the Second Constitutional Period, the erosion and disappearance of morals has been regarded as one of the reasons behind the decay of the Ottoman State. Therefore, special attention to morals education has been paid and rejuvenation and construction of morals according to the needs of the era were seen as a necessity (Gurbetoğlu, 2007). Moreover, values can also be understood as value judgments that regulate what is right, and the actions following it, and also help societies continue to exist and act in coherence (Özkan & Soylu, 2014).

A 'sense of duty' oriented perception of morality has been categorized to six sections: religious duties, personal duties, duties towards family, duties towards homeland, duties towards humanity and duties towards animals" which was contemporary to its age. "Similar to a Kantian perception of morality, Ottoman scholars based morals on the sense of duty, in which duty and morals were used interchangeably" (Erdem, 2006:103). A moral person requires first religious morality, which was solidified with religious motifs. That said, whether the morals of Islam should be included in the education system and what the foundations for the moral education should be has been discussed during the late Ottoman period (Berkes, 2006). In the Second Constitution period, within the realm of morality, religion has become a subsection and the necessity to understand morals as a science can be traced (Alkan, 2008:67). This is evident in both textbooks with the association between religion and science. It is evident that one can see the use of religious motifs to solidify the concepts, on the other hand, the texts also mentions experiments and sciences (*ilim*) in order to reinforce the scientific roots to morals. Yazıbaşı (2014) asserted that in Ahmet Cevat's 'Lectures on Morality', printed in 1334, along with religious references, the author also referenced the views of intellectuals of the Western world, such as Shakespeare and Benjamin Franklin. In a similar fashion, Ali Seydi's 'Lectures on Morality' printed in 1336, included sayings of "*sahabe*" companions of Prophet Muhammad, along with scientists and philosophers (Bayraktar, 2015:187). Nurdoğan (2014) stated that after the 1880s it is evident to see the teaching of the religious-authoritarian social values and mundane-progressive ideas together in the textbooks. Compared to the textbook written in the early Republican period, the earlier textbook of the Second Constitutional Period has more religious connotations in accomplishing duties. Therefore, one can claim that the understanding of religion's effect on morality continued to exist in the latter period.

According to our findings, the understanding of morals also founded upon "personal duties" as the second strongest moral value an individual should possess. According to the textbooks, these values are "healthiness, cleanliness, moderation, prudence, righteousness, self-respect, modesty, courage, cool-headedness, patience, self-confidence, entrepreneurship, tidiness, and protecting one's life." Doğan (1994) noticed that the textbooks of the Second Constitutional Period possessed most of the values mentioned above. Yazıbaşı (2018) also found that values such as studying, being patient, courage, helpfulness, prudence, respecting elders, obedience, self-sacrifice and patriotism were mentioned in the booklets about morals for primary school students of the same era. Additionally, Yinilmez Akagündüz (2017) stated that similar values such as righteousness, honesty, courage, self-sacrifice, helpfulness, being hard-working, attention to manners, respect to the elderly and compassion to juniors were mentioned in the textbook *Lectures on Morality and Civilization for Primary Schools* that was written by Ali Rıza and printed in 1331. In a similar fashion, in today's Turkey, in the 2019 curriculum for primary schools similar core values has been established: "justice, friendship, honesty, self control, patience, respect, love, responsibility, patriotism and helpfulness."

Both textbooks emphasize the importance of having a profession. This is underlined with the assumption that some of the students will not continue their education. The text glorified being a tradesman and entrepreneurship while also mentioning that people should not expect everything from the state and shouldn't necessarily aspire only to government jobs. A rather strong and negative outlook and language were used for the civil service and recommended children not to aspire to becoming civil servants. This view and language were softened in the early Republican era. While the aspiration to become civil servants has been criticized, the necessity of respecting civil servants such as postmen, municipal workers, gendarmerie and police has been underlined. The significance of entrepreneurship becomes evident as criticizing the pre-Constitution period, which is apparent in the critiques of intellectuals of the era: educational institutions should not be aiming to raise civil servants, they should concentrate on raising specialists and entrepreneurs who are successful in sciences, arts, technology and trade (Akyüz, 2011). Furthermore, Üstel (2014) attests that by strengthening the idea of people having entrepreneurial skills in the *Lectures on Morality* textbooks of the Second Constitutional Period, educators had transferred to schools the ideas of the national economic politics of the Unionists that came after 1908. While entrepreneurship is considered as a societal duty, this statement was removed from the Republican version. Both textbooks not only underlined the importance of increasing local production instead of importing goods, but also mention loving, respecting, and encouraging the artists, craftsman and tradesman. Furthermore, the textbooks pointed out the proliferation of the Muslim businesses in İstanbul and provinces, which coincides with the internal politics of the time with the transformation of the country's economic structure towards developing a Muslim bourgeoisie (Akagündüz, 2015:61).

According to finding of this study, the idea of the country's progress has been linked with "civilized countries" and the current state of affairs has been compared with Europe and the U.S.A. The changes in the political and social structures are reflected in the curriculum and the textbooks. These changes can be seen in the representation of the value of patriotism, which focused on Ottoman country, society, and state and with the mentioning of Turkish-ness in the textbooks. The effects of the Balkan Wars can be detected in the earlier version, in which the "Greeks, Bulgarians, Serbians and Montenegrin" are acknowledged only with the territories that they seized in Rumelia. Following this trend, Ahmet Cevat's textbook printed in 1330, and Ali Seydi's printed in 1332 brought up "the seized territories of Greeks, Bulgarians, Serbians and Montenegrin whenever an opportunity arises" (Alkan, 2008:63). Furthermore, in the 1333 version, there is only one instance where the word 'sultan' was used without a compliment, and to strengthen the ties between the Ottoman citizens, concepts of "fellowship, love and helpfulness" were interlinked. Similarly, Pehlivan Ađırakça (2013) states that there was not any praise on the concept of the constitutional monarchy in Ahmet Cevat's textbook (Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye) printed in 1331.

Social morality was equated with the moral duties of the individual not only for him/herself, but it also for all humanity and is perceived as a prerequisite for the societies to live together. Both textbooks included values such as helpfulness, respect to rights, righteousness and being civil in relations. On the other hand, the 1333 version has the values of "fellowship, keeping promises, being grateful, honesty" that solidify social cohesion. That said, this idea of living together was removed from the Republican period version. To sustain harmony in society, a functionalist approach to society that supports respecting basic human rights with helping each other, and "civilized behavior" in interpersonal matters was supported. Alabaş's (2018) research showed that the textbook of *Lectures on Morality and Civilizations* for the 1924 school year was based upon the premise that social life is about the bond between people and focused on the necessities of living together and for solidarity it underlined the importance of teaching the concept of "right" and uses of the concept. Both versions connect moral values to social conventions such as how to eat dinner, being kind and rules that pertain to "civilized behaviors."

According to another finding of this study, the duties towards treating animals is located under the personal duties and can be summarized as being good to animals and not harming them in any way by giving examples of the cruelties of humans.

In conclusion, moral values that are based on "moral duties" in the *Lectures on Morality* textbooks are evaluated in the contexts of firstly "cognitive," with the comprehension of knowledge and concepts, secondly, "physical," by highlighting the requirements of physical strength and acquiring some basic physical abilities, and lastly, in the "social" context as it yearns for the ideas and concepts of social cohesion, unity and integrity.

## REFERENCES

- Akagündüz, Ü. (2015). *II. Meşrutiyet döneminde kadın olmak*. İstanbul: Yeni İnsan Yayınevi.
- Akyüz, Y. (2011). Osmanlı döneminden cumhuriyete geçilirken eğitim-öğretim alanında yaşanan dönüşümler. *Pegem Eğitim ve Öğretim Dergisi*, 1(2), 9-22.
- Akyüz, Y. (2018). *Türk eğitim tarihi*. Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- Alabaş, R. (2018). Cumhuriyet'in ilk yıllarında ilk mekteplerde insani ve toplumsal değerler eğitimi: Resimli, Yeni Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye ve Medeniye ders kitabı örneği. *Çağdaş Türkiye Tarihi Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 18(36), 55-87.
- Alkan, M. Ö. (2008). Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda modernleşme ve eğitim. *Türkiye Araştırmaları Literatür Dergisi*, 6(12), 9-84.
- Alkan, M. Ö. (2014). Militarist Turkish-Islamic synthesis: Official ideology, official history and nationalism in the Second Constitutional Period. *Turkish Journal of Middle Eastern Studies*, 1(2), 147-172.
- Ayhan, H. (2000). Cumhuriyet dönemi din eğitimine genel bir bakış: Atatürk'ün İslam dini ve din eğitimi hakkındaki görüşleri. *M.Ü. İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 18, 5-27.
- Batır, B. (2007). *İkinci Meşrutiyet'ten Tevhid-i Tedrisat'a Türkiye'de ilköğretim (1908- 1924)*, Doktora Tezi. İstanbul Üniversitesi, Atatürk İlkeleri ve İnkılâp Tarihi Enstitüsü, İstanbul.
- Bayraktar, M. F. (2015). Son dönem Osmanlı ahlâk terbiyecilerinden Ali Seydi Bey, İ. Kurt ve S. A. Tüz (Yay. Haz.) *Son dönem Osmanlı ahlâk terbiyecileri ve ahlak terbiyesi* içinde (ss.181-198). İstanbul: Ensar Neşriyat.
- Berkes, N. (2006). *Türkiye'de çağdaşlaşma*. ed. by Ahmet Kuyaş. İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları.
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9(2), p.27-40.
- Cicioğlu, H. (1985). *Türkiye Cumhuriyeti'nde ilk ve ortaöğretim (tarihi gelişimi)*. Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi Yayınları.
- Doğan, N.(1994). *Ders kitapları ve sosyalleşme (1876-1918)*. İstanbul: Bağlam Yayıncılık.
- Erdem, H. (2006). *Son devir Osmanlı düşüncesinde ahlak*. İstanbul: DEM Yayınları.
- Ergün, M. (1996). *II. Meşrutiyet devrinde eğitim hareketleri (1908-1914)*. Ankara: Ocak Yayınları.
- Fichter, J. (2001). *Sosyoloji nedir?*. (N. Çelebi, Çev.). Ankara: Atilla Kitapevi.
- Gurbetoğlu, A. (2007). II. Meşrutiyet dönemi çocuk dergilerinde ahlak eğitimi ve ahlaki değerler (1908–1918). *Yüzüncü Yıl Üniversitesi, Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 4(1), 81-101.
- Güngör, E. (1997). *Ahlâk psikolojisi ve sosyal ahlâk*. İstanbul: Ötüken Neşriyat.
- Güven, İ. (2014). *Türk eğitim tarihi*. Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- H. Natan & Midhat Sadullah. 1333 [1917]. *Yeni Musâhabât-ı Ahlâkiye, Diniye, Medeniye, Tarihiye*. İstanbul: Şirket-i Mürettebiye.
- Kamer, T. & Alabaş, R. (2017). Ahlâk terbiyesi kongresi ve basına yansımaları, *Kastamonu Eğitim Dergisi*, 25(2), 821-848.
- Maarif Vekâleti (1924). *İlk mekteplerin müfredat programı*. İstanbul: Matbaa-i Amire.
- Maarif-i Umûmiye Nezareti (1913). *Mekâtib-i ibtidaiye ders müfredatı bir ve iki dersane ve muallimli mekteplere mahsus*. İstanbul: Matbaa-ı Âmire.
- Maarif-i Umûmiye Nezareti (1914). *Mekâtib-i ibtidaiye ders müfredatı altı, beş, dört ve üç dersane ve muallimli mekteplere mahsus*. İstanbul: Matbaa-ı Âmire.
- Meydan, H. (2015). Zeynizâde Mehmet Hâzık, İ. Kurt ve S. A. Tüz (Yay. Haz.) *Son dönem Osmanlı ahlâk terbiyecileri ve ahlak terbiyesi* içinde (ss.113-148). İstanbul: Ensar Neşriyat.

- Midhat Sadullah. 1339 [1923]. *Resimli, yeni musâhabât-ı ahlâkiye ve medeniye*. İstanbul: Orhaniye Matbaası.
- Nurdoğan, A. M. (2014). II. Abdülhamid döneminde ilköğretim okullarındaki ders kitapları ve tarih öğretimi. *Türk Tarih Eğitimi Dergisi*, 3(2), 82-111.
- Oruç, Ş. (2007). Osmanlı'nın son döneminde eğitim uygulamalarında yer alan buluş yöntemi ve bu yöntemle yapılmış bir ders örneği. *Türkiye Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 2, 139-164.
- Özalp, R. (1982). *Milli eğitimle ilgili mevzuat (1857-1923)*. İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Basımevi.
- Özkan, R. & Soylu, A. (2014). Eğitim fakültesi öğrencilerinin benimsedikleri temel insani değerler (Niğde il örneği). *Turkish Studies International Periodical for the Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic*. 9(2), 1253-126.
- Pehlivan Ağırakça, G. (2013). *Mekteplerde ahlâk eğitim ve öğretimi (1839-1923)*. İstanbul: Çamlıca Yayınları.
- Şanal, M. (2001). Mustafa Sâti Bey'in öğretmenlere önermiş olduğu öğretim yöntemleri, *Erciyes Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 11, 309-323.
- Ülken, H. Z. (1958). *Felsefeye giriş ikinci kısım*. Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Yayınları.
- Ülken, H. Z. (1969). *Sosyoloji sözlüğü*. İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Basımevi.
- Üstel, F. (2014). *Makbul vatandaşın peşinde II. Meşrutiyet'ten bugüne vatandaşlık eğitimi*. İstanbul: İletişim.
- Yazıbaşı, M. A. (2014). *II. Meşrutiyet dönemi sıbyan/ibtidai ve rüştiye mekteplerinde ahlak eğitimi ve öğretimi*. Doktora tezi. Ankara Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Ankara.
- Yazıbaşı, M. A. (2018). Son dönem Osmanlı ahlak risalelerinde öne çıkan değerler (1908-1918). *Amasya Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 6(10), 347-363.
- Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2013). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri*. Ankara: Seçkin.
- Yinilmez Akagündüz, S. (2017). II. Meşrutiyet dönemi ahlak eğitimine örnek bir ders kitabı: İbtidailere Malumat-ı Ahlakıyye ve Medeniyye, *Kesit Akademi Dergisi*, 7, 240-257.